

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ב – השוחט

דף מא – Daf 41

1. **ישראל לצעוריה קא מיכּוּן, and does not mean to shecht his friend's animal for idolatry**

On the previous Daf, Amoraim argued if one who *shechts* another person's animal for idolatry prohibits it. The Gemara proves that Tannaim argue about this question: if an idolator performed an idolatrous ניסוך – *libation* with a Jew's wine, the Tanna Kamma says he prohibits it, but other Tannaim say it remains permitted for two reasons: firstly, because an עב"ם only performs ניסוך in front of an idol. Secondly, because the Jew can say: לא כל הימנך – שתאסר ייני לאונסי – “You have no ability to prohibit my wine against my will.” Rav Nachman, Rav Amram, and Rav Yitzchak, who say one does not prohibit someone else's animal by *shechting* it for idolatry, explain that although Tannaim here say an idolator prohibits a Jew's wine through ניסוך, that is only true for a gentile, but regarding a Jew, לצעוריה קא מיכּוּן – *he intends only to torment his fellow by deceiving him to think that his animal is becoming prohibited, but does not actually intend to shecht it for idolatry.* This does not apply to a *Jewish apostate*, whose declared intent for idolatry is taken seriously.

2. **One may not shecht into a pit; shechting cleanly in one's חצר**

The next Mishnah states that one may not *shecht* into seas, rivers, or בלים (which may appear to be *shechting* for *avodah zarah*), but he may *shecht* into a pool of water, or in a boat on top of בלים. אין שוחטין לגומא כל עיקר. *We may not shecht into a pit at all*, because this was a practice of מינין for idolatry. The Mishnah continues that one may make a pit in his house for the blood to collect there, ובשוק לא יעשה בן – *but one may not do so in the street*, שלא יחקה את הצדוקים – *so as not to follow the צדוקים's practices.* Since the Mishnah first forbade *shechting* into a pit altogether, Rava reinterprets the Mishnah's permit to make a pit in one's house: הרוצה לנקר חצרו – *one who wants to [keep] his yard clean when he shechts*, עושה מקום חוץ לגומא – *he should make an area outside the pit and shecht over it, and the blood will drip down to the pit.* But he may not do so in the marketplace, which appears to be following the צדוקים's practices (since the שוק's cleanliness is not his concern). A Baraisa supports this interpretation, and concludes that if one did so, צריך בדיקה אחריו – *he requires an inspection to determine if he is a מין.*

3. **Shechting for the sake of a korban**

The next Mishnah states that if one *shechts* an animal (of *chullin*) for the sake of a *korban*, עולה, שלמים, אשם תלוי, פסח, or תודה, the *shechitah* is invalid (מדרבנן), because an onlooker may conclude that he was *makdish* it for that *korban* at the time of *shechitah*. [Rebbe Shimon says the *shechitah* is valid.] If one *shechted* an animal for the sake of a *korban*, חטאת, אשם ודאי, a *bechor*, a *maaser (beheimah)*, or תמורה, the *shechitah* is valid. Since these *korbanos* cannot be brought voluntarily, but as a result of a particular event, it would be known about by others. Therefore, people realize that his declared intent is meaningless, and the *shechitah* is not disqualified. The Mishnah concludes: זה הכלל – *this is the rule: any [korban] which can be vowed or donated, the shechitah is invalid* – *if one shechts for that [korban's] sake, it is forbidden to eat.* But if one *shechts* for the sake of a *korban* which cannot be brought voluntarily, the *shechitah* is valid. [The Gemara explains why an אשם תלוי and *korban* פסח are in the first category.] Rebbe Yannai says the Mishnah's ruling does not apply to בעלי מומין, because people realize they are not *korbanos*. Rebbe Yochanan argues, because people sometimes cover the מום and it goes unnoticed.

Siman – Grandma

The **Grandma** who was annoyed at her **grandson who tormented his brother by claiming to shecht his sheep for avodah zarah**, and was relieved that at least he **kept the chatzeir clean by shechting near the pit**, was dismayed when her other grandson **shechted her last sheep for a korban that isנדבב making it מדרבנן**.



The **Grandma** who was annoyed at her grandson who tormented his brother by claiming to *shecht* his sheep for *avodah zarah*, and was relieved that at least he kept the *chatzeir* clean by *shechting* near the pit, was dismayed when her other grandson *shechted* her last sheep for a *korban* that is נידר ונידב making it מדרבנן.

3 things to remember

1. ישראל לצעוריה קא מיכוי, and does not mean to *shecht* his friend's animal for idolatry
2. One may not *shecht* into a pit; *shechting* cleanly in one's חצר
3. *Shechting* for the sake of a *korban*

